

To: Tyler Ashcroft[tashcrof@blm.gov]; Allison Ginn[aginn@blm.gov]
Cc: Ashley Losey[alosey@blm.gov]; Aaron Curtis[acurtis@blm.gov]; Cameron Cox[cdcox@blm.gov]; Matthew Zweifel[mzweifel@blm.gov]
From: Thomas, Nathan
Sent: 2017-05-16T15:41:20-04:00
Importance: Normal
Subject: data call
Received: 2017-05-16T15:42:09-04:00
WO Data Call BENM and GSENM May 15, 2017 Final.docx

Hey all here is our response to the cultural question in the data call

--
Nate Thomas
Deputy Preservation Officer BLM Utah
Cultural Resource Program Lead
440 West 200 South, Suite 500
Salt Lake City, Utah 84145
(801) 539-4276

WASHINGTON OFFICE DATA CALL FOR BENM AND GSENM

DATE: May 15, 2017

SUBJECT: List of cultural uses/values for site; number of sites; other quantifiable information where available for the Bears Ears National Monument and Grand Staircase-Escalante National Monument.

FROM: Nathan Thomas, Deputy Preservation Officer/State Archaeologist BLM-Utah, Utah State Office, (801) 539-4276

I. STATEMENT OF PURPOSE

To discuss the location, type and number of archaeological sites and objects within the boundaries of the Bears Ears and Grand Staircase-Escalante National Monuments.

II. BACKGROUND

Almost all archaeological records from archaeological surveys and excavations for the past 50 years are physically housed or available through GIS at the Utah SHPO or at BLM Field or Monument Offices. The Utah SHPO's archaeological records and BLM's own internal records serve as the starting point or foundation for any archaeological survey or excavation.

III. NUMBERS OF SITES AND PERCENTAGE SURVEYED

Sites

According to the National Register Bulletin 36: *Guidelines for Evaluating and Registering Archaeological Properties*, a "site" is the location of a significant event or of historical human occupation or activity (page 43). BLM-Utah further defines an archaeological site as:

1. At least 10 artifacts of a single class (e.g., 10 sherds) within 10-meter diameter area, except when all pieces appear to originate from a single source (e.g., one ceramic pot, one glass bottle),
2. At least 15 artifacts which include at least 2 classes of artifact types (e.g., sherds, nails, glass) within a 10-meter diameter area
3. One or more archaeological features in temporal association with any number of artifacts, or
4. Two or more temporally associated archaeological features without artifacts.

According to the Utah SHPO, as of February 6, 2017 there are **25,734 recorded archaeological sites** and four archaeological districts within **Bears Ears National Monument** (BENM). More than 70% of these sites are prehistoric (pre-dating the 1800s). These prehistoric sites include pottery and stone tool (lithic) scatters, the remains of cooking features (hearts), storage features such as adobe granaries and sub-surface stone lined granaries, prehistoric roads, petroglyphs, pictographs and cliff dwellings. Historic sites include historic debris scatters, roads, fences, uranium and vanadium mines from World War II and the Cold War.

According to the Utah SHPO, as of March 6, 2017 there are **3,985 recorded archaeological sites** within the **Grand Staircase-Escalante National Monument** (GSENM). However, the GSENM estimates that there are **more likely around 6,000 recorded** archaeological sites within the GSENM. The GSENM figures the SHPO does not have all of the older site forms from the 1960's, 70's, 80's and 90's.

Similar site types exist for the GSENM as in Bears Ears National Monument. Except there are much fewer granaries. Granaries are very common along the Escalante and in the Fiftymile Mountain area, and they also appear at all formative locations but not as concentrated as the Escalante and Fiftymile

WASHINGTON OFFICE DATA CALL FOR BENM AND GSENM

Mountain area. It is safe to say that the BENM has a higher density of cliff dwellings and historic mining sites.

Class III Survey

BLM's 8110 Manual – *Identifying and Evaluating Cultural Resources*, defines Class III – Intensive Survey (Class III Survey) as “Intensive survey is most useful when it is necessary to know precisely what historic properties exist in a given area or when information sufficient for later evaluation and treatment decisions is needed on individual historic properties. Intensive survey describes the distribution of properties in an area; determines the number, location and condition of properties; determines the types of properties actually present within the area; permits classification of individual properties; and records the physical extent of specific properties (page .21B4).” In Utah the primary field method for a Class III Survey is a series 15-meter parallel transects, that cover a project area that has the potential to disturb ground surface.

BLM has not completely surveyed either Monument. **The total percentage of survey for the BENM is 9.2% and 5.7% of the GSENM.**

IV. ARCHAEOLOGICAL DISTRICTS

According to the National Register Bulletin 36: Guidelines for Evaluating and Registering Archaeological Properties, a “district” is a grouping of sites, buildings, structures, or objects that are linked historically by function, theme, or physical development or aesthetically by plan (page 43).

The following archaeological districts are either completely within or partially within the BENM: Butler Wash, Grand Gulch, Natural Bridges, and the Salt Creek Archaeological District.

Although there discrete concentrations of archaeological sites, both prehistoric (i.e. Fremont sites) and historic (i.e. historic ranching and Hole-in-Rock Trail locations) in the GSENM. No formal archaeological districts have been identified by the GSENM.

V. CULTURAL RESOURCE VALUES

The **BENM** was designated at the request of the Bears Ears Inter-Tribal Coalition. The Inter-Tribal Coalition, which includes the Hopi, Zuni Tribe, Navajo Nation, Ute Mountain Ute, and Northern Ute, have stated that the entire 1.35 million acre National Monument includes important cultural values. The importance of these values, which was recognized in the monument proclamation, are discussed in the Inter-Tribal Coalitions monument proposal, which was submitted to the department on October 15, 2015.

Following the designation of **GSENM** consultations were initiated with the Native American tribes associated with the GSENM area, including the Hopi, the Kaibab Paiute, the San Juan Paiute, the Paiute Indian Tribes of Utah, the Zuni, and the Ute, and the Navajo. Over the past 20 years the Hopi and the Kaibab Paiute have been most closely associated with the Monument and most responsive to continued consultations, as the GSENM area is central to the historic and prehistoric territories of these two tribes. All tribes considered the Monument area to be culturally important; the Hopi (as the modern descendants of the Ancestral Puebloans), for example, can trace the migrations of at least twelve clans through what is today GSENM (Bernardini 2005). The tribal connections to this land are probably best described by an example from the Kaibab Paiute, as related to ethnographers from the University of Arizona, as follows (Stoffle et al 2001):

“The Southern Paiute people continue to maintain a strong attachment to the holy lands of their ethnic group as well as to their own local territory. These attachments continued even though Paiute sovereignty

WASHINGTON OFFICE DATA CALL FOR BENM AND GSENM

has been lost over portions of these lands due to Navajo ethnic group expansion, encroachment by Euroamericans, and Federal government legislation. Despite the loss of Paiute sovereignty over most traditional lands, Southern Paiute people continue to affiliate themselves with these places as symbols of their common ethnic identity. Additionally, all Southern Paiute people continue to perform traditional ceremonies along with the menarche and first childbirth rites of passage rituals. The locations at which these ceremonies and rituals have been or are currently performed become transformed from secular "sites" to highly sacred locations or places. By virtue of the transformation of locations into sacred places, Southern Paiute people reaffirm their ties to traditional lands because they have carried out their sacred responsibilities as given to them by the Creator."

Local ranching began in the 1860s, and became a major focus of area livelihood following the cessation of the Blackhawk War and increased settlement in the 1870s. Ranching was initially small scale and for local subsistence, but the herds quickly grew so that by the late 1800s the raising of cattle, sheep, and goats was of major economic importance. Ranching and subsistence farming was historically the backbone of the local economies, and this is still reflected in the views of the modern communities surrounding GSENM. In modern times the economic importance of ranching has somewhat diminished, but the culture of, and past history of, livestock grazing and ranching is one of the important "glues" that binds local communities and families in the GSENM area.

The archaeological values of the GSENM are summarized well within its respective proclamation:

Archeological inventories carried out to date show extensive use of places within the monument by ancient Native American culture. The area was a contact point for the Anasazi and Fremont cultures, and the evidence of this mingling provides a significant opportunity for archeological study. The cultural resources discovered so far in the monument are outstanding in their variety of cultural affiliation, type and distribution. Hundreds of recorded sites include rock art panels, occupation sites, campsites and granaries. Many more undocumented sites that exist within the monument are of significant scientific and historic value worthy of preservation for future study.

The monument is rich in human history. In addition to occupations by the Anasazi and Fremont cultures, the area has been used by modern tribal groups, including the Southern Paiute and Navajo. John Wesley Powell's expedition did initial mapping and scientific field work in the area in 1872. Early Mormon pioneers left many historic objects, including trails, inscriptions, ghost towns such as the Old Paria townsite, rock houses, and cowboy line camps, and built and traversed the renowned Hole-in-the-Rock Trail as part of their epic colonization efforts. Sixty miles of the Trail lie within the monument, as does Dance Hall Rock, used by intrepid Mormon pioneers and now a National Historic Site.